#### MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **July 14, 2011** 

**Present:** Richard Dana, Robert Ferguson, Matt Hill, Renee Hutter, Rich Laffin, John Manning,

David Riehle, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel, Mark Thomas, **Absent:** Jennifer Haskamp (excused), Matt Mazanec (excused) **Staff Present:** Amy Spong, Christine Boulware, Joey Larson

#### **BUSINESS MEETING**

I. CALL TO ORDER: 5:05 by Chair Manning

- **II. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:** Commissioner Dana motioned to approve the agenda as amended. Commissioner Riehle seconded the motion. The motion passed 10-0.
- III. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST: None were discussed.

# IV. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES:

- A. May 26, 2011 Public Hearing/Permit Review
- B. June 9, 2011 Business Meeting
- C. June 23, 2011 Public Hearing/Permit Review

Commissioner Dana motioned to approve the meeting minutes. Commissioner Hutter seconded the motion. The motion passed 10-0.

# V. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS:

**A.** Chair Manning reminded commissioners of a discussion of the Executive Committee had that was mentioned at the June 23 HPC meeting. There is concern about the future of National Register Eligible properties located along University Avenue. With the recent loss of Porky's, there has been some discussion about what the HPC should do to prevent the removal or significant alteration of these historic resources.

### **VI. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS:**

**A.** June Design Review Statistics – Staff informed that 75 permits were approved in June. That is the second highest number of staff reviews ever processed in a month. Many of the permits are for properties with storm damage.

**B.** Legislative Hearing Notification – Not discussed.

**C.** The vacancy of an architect on the HPC will soon be filled by Pat Quinn who will serve the remainder of former Commissioner Meyer's term through the end of 2011 with potential for a reappointment of three years.

**D.** Notice of Appeal: The City Council will hear appeals on July 20, 2011 for the HPC decision regarding denial of the installation of glass block at 255 Sixth Street East. Commissioner Laffin stated his intention to attend the hearing. Only one letter of testimony had been received. Also, City Council will hear the appeal of a staff approval for the installation of a fence around the garden in the front yard of 797 Summit Avenue, House of Hope Church. This is the first appeal of a staff decision. There was some discussion about the staff approval, the appeal period, the design and location of the fence and the siting of the garden. Staff has briefed Council Member Carter. SARPA has indicated they are supportive of the garden, but not the fence.

#### VII. DISCUSSION:

**A.** Primer on applying New Construction Guidelines in Historic Districts (Spong) Staff noted that the HPC has reviewed some interesting, difficult and controversial proposals. The design review guidelines need to be improved and updated to address new construction and non-contributing buildings.

Commissioners need to be cognizant of making comments such as: "I like" and "I don't like" unless they are tied to a guideline/finding. Examples of new construction were shown in a presentation. The examples showed a range of compatibility and differentiation with existing historic buildings and district setting and context. The Lowertown design review guidelines will be revised and expanded as part of the OMF mitigation. There is a sub-agreement with the Capitol River Council and staff will be project manager. The mitigation includes an education component Local examples of new construction included:

- Lowertown Historic District:
  - o 270 Fourth Street East
- Hill Historic District:
  - o 80 N. Western Avenue Western Row
  - 108 N. Western Avenue single family home
  - o 698-702 Portland Avenue side-by-side double-house
  - The new vestibule at Dayton Avenue Presbyterian Church
- University-Raymond Commercial Historic District
  - Carleton Lofts additions to the historic buildings.

Staff talked about the process that the applications went through and some of the difficult review aspects. Some of the proposals had been through several preapplication reviews and the evolution of the designs was presented.

## **VIII. Committee Reports**

- **A. Education Committee** (Ferguson, Thomas, Trout-Oertel) No updates. Suggested that committees established at the retreat should reconnect.
- B. Greater Lowertown Master Plan Taskforce (Ferguson) Staff and commissioner Ferguson met with the taskforce chair and two consultant staff. Staff gave feedback on the preservation section of the draft plan and discussed preservation implications of the plan. There was good progress and discussion. The plan is still in draft form and there will be opportunity for the HPC to comment.
- C. Saint Paul Historic Survey Partnership Project (Trimble, Manning) Staff informed that the financial portion of the project wrapped up by June 30 and the paper portion will be complete by July 31. At the next business meeting there will be a presentation and formal adoption of the documents created by the project.
- D. 3M Advisory Committee/Workgroups update (Trimble, Mazanec) Commissioner Trimble stated that there will be a meeting of the Community Advisory Committee on July 21.

IX. ADJOURN: 7:00 P.M.

Submitted by: C. Boulware